

Foreign Tech Workers in the U.S.: Failures and Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of California at Davis

ASEE Engineering Deans Council Conference

February 9, 2016

<http://heather.cs.ucdavis.edu/ASEESlides.pdf>

Table of Contents

- 1 Setting the Stage
- 2 Why Do Employers Hire Foreign Students Instead of Americans?
- 3 Data
- 4 Remedies (and Non-Remedies)
- 5 Conclusions

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university;

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university; Ike has TWO MS degrees, from Top 10 university.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university; Ike has TWO MS degrees, from Top 10 university.
- Have up-to-date skillsets.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university; Ike has TWO MS degrees, from Top 10 university.
- Have up-to-date skillsets.
- Articulate, team players etc.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university; Ike has TWO MS degrees, from Top 10 university.
- Have up-to-date skillsets.
- Articulate, team players etc.
- Over 35.

Concrete Examples: “Dan” and “Ike”

- Can't view the data unless you understand the qualitative side.
- Two older Americans in Bay Area. “Dan” and “Ike.”
- Can't get full-time work. (Occasional contract work.)
- Dan has MS from Top 5 university; Ike has TWO MS degrees, from Top 10 university.
- Have up-to-date skillsets.
- Articulate, team players etc.
- Over 35.
- But my foreign students **apply to the same firms, and get jobs.**

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Concrete Example: “Jim”

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.
- Never got steady engineering work after that.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.
- Never got steady engineering work after that.
- Today working as a technician, e.g. installing office PCs.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.
- Never got steady engineering work after that.
- Today working as a technician, e.g. installing office PCs.
- The field of engineering lost this highly innovative engineer.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.
- Never got steady engineering work after that.
- Today working as a technician, e.g. installing office PCs.
- The field of engineering lost this highly innovative engineer.
- Meanwhile, lots of foreign students were hired.

Concrete Example: “Jim”

- Son of Chinese immigrant parents.
- BSEE, MSCS from UCD, mid-1990s.
- At “household name” engineering firm, his innovative work was written up in the *Wall Street Journal*.
- But was later caught in big layoff.
- Never got steady engineering work after that.
- Today working as a technician, e.g. installing office PCs.
- The field of engineering lost this highly innovative engineer.
- Meanwhile, lots of foreign students were hired.
- I’ve seen **many, many** Dans, Ikes and Jims.

Table of Contents

- 1 Setting the Stage
- 2 Why Do Employers Hire Foreign Students Instead of Americans?
- 3 Data
- 4 Remedies (and Non-Remedies)
- 5 Conclusions

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Two Central Issues

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Two Central Issues

- Saving on labor costs.

Two Central Issues

- Saving on labor costs.
- Having immobile workers.

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

The Wage Factor

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

The Wage Factor

- Hard data,

The Wage Factor

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.

The Wage Factor

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- On average, the foreign tech workers are paid less than *comparable* (age, education etc.) Americans.

The Wage Factor

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- On average, the foreign tech workers are paid less than *comparable* (age, education etc.) Americans. **This is across the board, not just the “Infosyses” but also the “Intels.”**

The Wage Factor

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- On average, the foreign tech workers are paid less than *comparable* (age, education etc.) Americans. **This is across the board, not just the “Infosyses” but also the “Intels.”**
- **Young** foreign tech workers are paid *a lot* less than otherwise comparable **older** Americans (age 35+).

The Wage Factor

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- On average, the foreign tech workers are paid less than *comparable* (age, education etc.) Americans. **This is across the board, not just the “Infosyses” but also the “Intels.”**
- **Young** foreign tech workers are paid *a lot* less than otherwise comparable **older** Americans (age 35+).

Note: Unless stated otherwise, *American* means U.S. citizens (native, naturalized) and permanent residents.

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

The Age Factor

The Age Factor

- Job opportunities poor for those over age 35.

The Age Factor

- Job opportunities poor for those over age 35. See studies by NRC, American University/IEEE-USA etc.

The Age Factor

- Job opportunities poor for those over age 35. See studies by NRC, American University/IEEE-USA etc.
- *Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 4, 2016:

The Age Factor

- Job opportunities poor for those over age 35. See studies by NRC, American University/IEEE-USA etc.

- *Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 4, 2016:

Pete Edwards, EE; age 53; experience with 3-D printing!; having big difficulties finding work.

The Age Factor

- Job opportunities poor for those over age 35. See studies by NRC, American University/IEEE-USA etc.
- *Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 4, 2016:
Pete Edwards, EE; age 53; experience with 3-D printing!; having big difficulties finding work.
- The bottom line: **Employers are hiring young foreign tech workers instead of older Americans.**

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

The Immobility Factor

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.
- D. Swaim, former architect of Texas Instruments' immigration policy, now in private practice:

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.
- D. Swaim, former architect of Texas Instruments' immigration policy, now in private practice:
 - hireF-1students.com

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.
- D. Swaim, former architect of Texas Instruments' immigration policy, now in private practice:
 - hireF-1students.com
 - **Don't hire Americans**, because they can leave you any time.

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.
- D. Swaim, former architect of Texas Instruments' immigration policy, now in private practice:
 - hireF-1students.com
 - **Don't hire Americans**, because they can leave you any time.
 - **Instead, hire a foreign student** (and sponsor him/her for a green card), because they must stay 7-12 years.

The Immobility Factor

- Employers don't want engineers to leave for another firm in the midst of an urgent project.
- D. Swaim, former architect of Texas Instruments' immigration policy, now in private practice:
 - hireF-1students.com
 - **Don't hire Americans**, because they can leave you any time.
 - **Instead, hire a foreign student** (and sponsor him/her for a green card), because they must stay 7-12 years.
- Google!

Table of Contents

- 1 Setting the Stage
- 2 Why Do Employers Hire Foreign Students Instead of Americans?
- 3 Data
- 4 Remedies (and Non-Remedies)
- 5 Conclusions

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Data Showing the Problems

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** —

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** — Ptolemy's epicycles.

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** — Ptolemy's epicycles.
- But I have a “statistical license.” :-)

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** — Ptolemy's epicycles.
- But I have a “statistical license.” :-) And I know how engineers are educated, hired and employed.

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** — Ptolemy's epicycles.
- But I have a “statistical license.” :-) And I know how engineers are educated, hired and employed. No epicycles. :-)

Data Showing the Problems

- Hard data, consistent with economic theory.
- Various data sources: NRC, GAO, NCSG/NSF, BLS, NACE, etc.
- Easy to lie with data; even easier to **innocently misunderstand** — Ptolemy's epicycles.
- But I have a “statistical license.” :-) And I know how engineers are educated, hired and employed. No epicycles. :-)
- Key factors include: age, education, job type, **geographic region**.

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Some Findings

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)
- Older tech workers have much more trouble finding jobs (NRC, 2001; Brown, 1998 and Brown, 2009).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)
- Older tech workers have much more trouble finding jobs (NRC, 2001; Brown, 1998 and Brown, 2009).
- Brown (UCB Econ) attributes this to the influx of young foreign students.

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)
- Older tech workers have much more trouble finding jobs (NRC, 2001; Brown, 1998 and Brown, 2009).
- Brown (UCB Econ) attributes this to the influx of young foreign students.
- Foreign workers experience a big spike in earnings when they receive their green cards and become free agents (Mukhopadhyay, 2012).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)
- Older tech workers have much more trouble finding jobs (NRC, 2001; Brown, 1998 and Brown, 2009).
- Brown (UCB Econ) attributes this to the influx of young foreign students.
- Foreign workers experience a big spike in earnings when they receive their green cards and become free agents (Mukhopadhyay, 2012).
- No STEM labor shortage, including in CS (Salzman, 2013; Costa, 2012).

Some Findings

- H-1B tech workers earn less than comparable Americans (Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2012).
- Employers admit that they pay H-1Bs less than comparable Americans (NRC, 2001; GAO, 2011).
- Immigrants suppress the wages of U.S. PhDs (Borjas, 2006). (Correctly forecast by NSF, 1989.)
- Older tech workers have much more trouble finding jobs (NRC, 2001; Brown, 1998 and Brown, 2009).
- Brown (UCB Econ) attributes this to the influx of young foreign students.
- Foreign workers experience a big spike in earnings when they receive their green cards and become free agents (Mukhopadhyay, 2012).
- No STEM labor shortage, including in CS (Salzman, 2013; Costa, 2012).
- Wages essentially flat, both generally (BLS) and for new grads (NACE).

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Quality of the Foreign Workers

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Compared to U.S. natives of the same age, education etc., the former foreign students

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Compared to U.S. natives of the same age, education etc., the former foreign students

- are less likely to file patents;

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Compared to U.S. natives of the same age, education etc., the former foreign students

- are less likely to file patents;
- are less likely to be in R&D;

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Compared to U.S. natives of the same age, education etc., the former foreign students

- are less likely to file patents;
- are less likely to be in R&D;
- if they earn a doctorate, then on average it is at a less-selective university

Quality of the Foreign Workers

The average quality of the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce is substantially lower than that of U.S. natives (Bound, 2009; Hunt, 2011; Matloff, 2013).

Compared to U.S. natives of the same age, education etc., the former foreign students

- are less likely to file patents;
- are less likely to be in R&D;
- if they earn a doctorate, then on average it is at a less-selective university

Given the indirect and direct displacement of Americans, this says **we are replacing more-talented people with workers of lesser talent** — an alarming situation for our national economy etc.

Quality Examples

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Quality Examples

- “Ike” was rejected for a job in a group in which the workers (a) all were recent foreign students and (b) all came from very “ordinary” schools, e.g. University of Cincinnati. Good workers, surely, but likely not “the best and the brightest” — and probably not as good as Ike.

Quality Examples

- “Ike” was rejected for a job in a group in which the workers (a) all were recent foreign students and (b) all came from very “ordinary” schools, e.g. University of Cincinnati. Good workers, surely, but likely not “the best and the brightest” — and probably not as good as Ike.
- A 2009 *Washington Post* column highlighted a worker from India hired by Microsoft, with an MS from the University of North Texas, and working in Quality Assurance. So, likely a person of ordinary talent, doing ordinary work — hardly supporting the column’s claim that the foreign workers are “the seeds of tomorrow’s innovation.”

Quality Examples

- “Ike” was rejected for a job in a group in which the workers (a) all were recent foreign students and (b) all came from very “ordinary” schools, e.g. University of Cincinnati. Good workers, surely, but likely not “the best and the brightest” — and probably not as good as Ike.
- A 2009 *Washington Post* column highlighted a worker from India hired by Microsoft, with an MS from the University of North Texas, and working in Quality Assurance. So, likely a person of ordinary talent, doing ordinary work — hardly supporting the column’s claim that the foreign workers are “the seeds of tomorrow’s innovation.”
- The same column profiled another student from India, with an MS from UVa, hired by TI as a test engineer — again, hardly consistent with the “innovation” claim.

Pro-Industry “Research”

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Pro-Industry “Research”

- Most research with findings favorable to the industry are by researchers with financial ties to the industry (e.g. Zavodny “Each H-1B creates 2.62 jobs”), Peri, the Brookings people).

Pro-Industry “Research”

- Most research with findings favorable to the industry are by researchers with financial ties to the industry (e.g. Zavodny “Each H-1B creates 2.62 jobs”), Peri, the Brookings people).
- Much of this research cuts ethical corners, e.g. Zavodny paper.

Pro-Industry “Research”

- Most research with findings favorable to the industry are by researchers with financial ties to the industry (e.g. Zavodny “Each H-1B creates 2.62 jobs”), Peri, the Brookings people).
- Much of this research cuts ethical corners, e.g. Zavodny paper.
- Bias is clear: Most bibliographies have NO citations to research counter to their goal.

Pro-Industry “Research”

- Most research with findings favorable to the industry are by researchers with financial ties to the industry (e.g. Zavodny “Each H-1B creates 2.62 jobs”), Peri, the Brookings people).
- Much of this research cuts ethical corners, e.g. Zavodny paper.
- Bias is clear: Most bibliographies have NO citations to research counter to their goal.
- Common flaw: Failure to look at per-capita rates, e.g. in patenting and entrepreneurship.

Table of Contents

- 1 Setting the Stage
- 2 Why Do Employers Hire Foreign Students Instead of Americans?
- 3 Data
- 4 Remedies (and Non-Remedies)
- 5 Conclusions

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Remedies

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.
- So, require employers to pay more.

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.
- So, require employers to pay more. Set the legal wage floor for foreign workers at Level IV (67th percentile).

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.
- So, require employers to pay more. Set the legal wage floor for foreign workers at Level IV (67th percentile).
- Ban ageist practices, e.g. auto rejection of experienced U.S. workers.

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.
- So, require employers to pay more. Set the legal wage floor for foreign workers at Level IV (67th percentile).
- Ban ageist practices, e.g. auto rejection of experienced U.S. workers.
- Have OPT revert to the original 12-month “training” period.

Remedies

- Industry claims the H-1Bs are either brilliant or possess rare skills.
- So, require employers to pay more. Set the legal wage floor for foreign workers at Level IV (67th percentile).
- Ban ageist practices, e.g. auto rejection of experienced U.S. workers.
- Have OPT revert to the original 12-month “training” period.
- Broaden the “best and brightest” categories (O-1 work visa, National Interest Waiver for green cards).

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

NON-Remedies

NON-Remedies

- Do NOT add funds for enforcement. Most abuse is LEGAL.

NON-Remedies

- Do NOT add funds for enforcement. Most abuse is LEGAL.
- Do NOT just ban *replacing* Americans by H-1Bs;

NON-Remedies

- Do NOT add funds for enforcement. Most abuse is LEGAL.
- Do NOT just ban *replacing* Americans by H-1Bs; ban hiring H-1Bs *instead of* Americans.

NON-Remedies

- Do NOT add funds for enforcement. Most abuse is LEGAL.
- Do NOT just ban *replacing* Americans by H-1Bs; ban hiring H-1Bs *instead of* Americans.
- Do NOT enact “Staple a Green Card.”

NON-Remedies

- Do NOT add funds for enforcement. Most abuse is LEGAL.
- Do NOT just ban *replacing* Americans by H-1Bs; ban hiring H-1Bs *instead of* Americans.
- Do NOT enact “Staple a Green Card.” (Auto green cards to foreign STEM grad students.)

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

Just Say No to Staple-a-Green-Card

Just Say No to Staple-a-Green-Card

- Most new grads are YOUNG.

Just Say No to Staple-a-Green-Card

- Most new grads are **YOUNG**. So, would exacerbate the already-awful age issue.

Just Say No to Staple-a-Green-Card

- Most new grads are YOUNG. So, would exacerbate the already-awful age issue.
- Would reduce PhD production.

Just Say No to Staple-a-Green-Card

- Most new grads are YOUNG. So, would exacerbate the already-awful age issue.
- Would reduce PhD production.
- NSF (1989): Staple-a-Green-Card would drive Americans away from grad study.

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

1989 Internal NSF Report

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”
- Happened anyway due to big influx of foreign students after H-1B enacted in 1990.

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”
- Happened anyway due to big influx of foreign students after H-1B enacted in 1990.
 - Salary premium for MS over BS only \$10-15,000 (ASEE *Prism*, January 2016).

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”
- Happened anyway due to big influx of foreign students after H-1B enacted in 1990.
 - Salary premium for MS over BS only \$10-15,000 (ASEE *Prism*, January 2016). Financial disincentive for domestic students considering grad school!

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”
- Happened anyway due to big influx of foreign students after H-1B enacted in 1990.
 - Salary premium for MS over BS only \$10-15,000 (ASEE *Prism*, January 2016). Financial disincentive for domestic students considering grad school!
 - As NSF predicted, many PhD and even MS programs now 50% foreign or more.

1989 Internal NSF Report

See E. Weinstein, NBER, 1998. (Quotes paraphrased.)

- “Need to hold down STEM wages.”
- “Do this by flooding market with foreign students.”
- “Attract the foreign students with Staple-a-Green-Card.”
- “Stagnant wages will **discourage Americans from pursuing graduate study.**”
- Happened anyway due to big influx of foreign students after H-1B enacted in 1990.
 - Salary premium for MS over BS only \$10-15,000 (ASEE *Prism*, January 2016). Financial disincentive for domestic students considering grad school!
 - As NSF predicted, many PhD and even MS programs now 50% foreign or more.
- Would be even worse with SAGC.

Table of Contents

- 1 Setting the Stage
- 2 Why Do Employers Hire Foreign Students Instead of Americans?
- 3 Data
- 4 Remedies (and Non-Remedies)
- 5 Conclusions**

Foreign Tech
Workers in the
U.S.:
Failures and
Remedies

Norm Matloff
University of
California at
Davis

ASEE
Engineering
Deans Council
Conference

Setting the
Stage

Why Do
Employers
Hire Foreign
Students
Instead of
Americans?

Data

Remedies (and
Non-
Remedies)

Conclusions

The Bottom Line

The Bottom Line

- Thanks to ASEE for inviting me.

The Bottom Line

- Thanks to ASEE for inviting me.
- I hope to challenge your unquestioned assumptions about foreign students and the tech job market.
- I leave you with this question:

The Bottom Line

- Thanks to ASEE for inviting me.
- I hope to challenge your unquestioned assumptions about foreign students and the tech job market.
- I leave you with this question:

Do we want foreign-worker programs that discourage Americans from going to grad school?

The Bottom Line

- Thanks to ASEE for inviting me.
- I hope to challenge your unquestioned assumptions about foreign students and the tech job market.

- I leave you with this question:

Do we want foreign-worker programs that discourage Americans from going to grad school?

- These slides available at
<http://heather.cs.ucdavis.edu/ASEESlides.pdf>